MIKAILALSYS
Journal of Multidisciplinary Sciences

e-ISSN : 2987-2286
p-ISSN : 2987-3924

Index: Harvard, Boston, Sydney, Copernicus, Sinta 4, Scilit, Semantic, Google, etc

https://doi.org/10.58578/mikailalsys.v4i3.11594

Analysis of the Success Factors in the Implementation of the Street Vendor Management Policy in the Food Colony Area of Pamekasan Regency

Syafiril Ajmal Yanotama & Rosyidatuzzahro Anisykurlillah
UPN Veteran Jawa Timur, Indonesia
ajmalyanutama@gmail.com; rosyida.adne@upnjatim.ac.id

Article Info:

Submitted:	Revised:	Accepted:	Published:
Jun 16, 2026	Jul 14, 2026	Jul 26, 2026	Jul 31, 2026

Abstract

The relocation of street vendors is a strategic policy adopted by the Government of Pamekasan Regency to improve public space management and provide a more organized business environment through the development of the Food Colony. However, its implementation has faced challenges related to vendor acceptance and the sustainability of economic activities at the relocation site. This study aimed to analyze the implementation of the street vendor relocation policy using George C. Edwards III's framework, encompassing communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. A descriptive qualitative approach was employed, with data collected through interviews, observations, and documentation involving the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, and Manpower; the Municipal Police; the Department of Transportation; and relocated street vendors. Data were analyzed through data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. The findings indicate that policy communication was facilitated through socialization, mediation, and persuasive approaches, enabling information to be conveyed clearly to the affected vendors. The resource dimension was supported by

Mikailalsys is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License

adequate facilities and interagency coordination, while policy implementers demonstrated a strong commitment to the relocation process. Nevertheless, several vendors remained reluctant to relocate because of concerns regarding declining income, leading some to continue operating outside the designated Food Colony area. The bureaucratic structure functioned effectively through an integrated implementation team and clearly defined institutional responsibilities. The study concludes that the relocation policy has been procedurally well implemented, but its substantive effectiveness remains constrained by the limited economic sustainability of relocated vendors. These findings contribute to street vendor management policy by demonstrating that procedural compliance must be accompanied by strategies that strengthen vendors' economic viability. Enhancing promotional activities, improving the attractiveness of the Food Colony, and enforcing regulations consistently are therefore essential for optimizing policy outcomes.

Keywords: Food Colony; Policy Implementation; Street Vendor Management; Street Vendor Relocation; Urban Public Space

INTRODUCTION

Public space is an essential component of regional development because it functions as a shared area that accommodates social, economic, cultural, and political activities within society. Public space is not only a physical area accessible to citizens but also a medium for social interaction, collective identity formation, and strengthening social cohesion among communities (Mammola et al., 2021). The quality of public space management reflects the government's ability to balance public accessibility, environmental sustainability, and various community interests within urban areas (Masripah et al., 2026).

From the perspective of public governance, public space plays a strategic role in supporting inclusive regional development because it becomes an arena where different community interests interact (Agustino, 2017). Effective management of public spaces requires not only physical regulation but also consideration of social and economic aspects to address increasingly complex urban challenges (Low & Smart, 2020). Therefore, public space management has become an important indicator of local government capacity in regulating shared resources and ensuring public benefits (Winarno, 2026).

The development of urban economic activities has expanded the function of public spaces into locations for informal economic activities, including street vending (Mustofa et

al., 2026). Street vendors utilize strategic public areas because they provide accessibility to consumers, lower operational costs, and opportunities to maintain business sustainability (Haris et al., 2024).The existence of street vendors also contributes to urban economic dynamics by creating employment opportunities and supporting local economic circulation (Muksin, 2024).

The informal sector plays an important role in developing countries because it provides alternative employment opportunities for communities that cannot be fully absorbed by the formal sector. Street vendors contribute to household income, provide affordable goods and services, and strengthen local economic networks (Pratama & Tukiman, 2024). Therefore, street vendors should not only be viewed as informal economic actors but also as part of the local economic structure that requires proper management and empowerment.

From an economic development perspective, street vendors support micro-enterprise growth through interactions with suppliers, consumers, and other supporting economic sectors. The sustainability of street vendor activities is influenced by business location, consumer accessibility, and government support through empowerment-oriented policies (Mujahidin, 2026). Consequently, local governments face the challenge of creating policies that balance economic empowerment and public space regulation.

However, uncontrolled street vendor activities may create conflicts regarding the utilization of public spaces (Dunn, 2003a). Trading activities on sidewalks, roadsides, and public facilities can reduce pedestrian accessibility, disrupt traffic flow, and affect urban environmental quality (Aditya et al., 2024). Poor management of street vendor activities may also interfere with spatial planning and public facility functions (Subandara et al., 2022).

The existence of street vendors represents a complex policy issue because they provide economic benefits while simultaneously creating challenges for urban management. On the one hand, street vendors contribute to employment creation and economic opportunities for communities. On the other hand, their activities require regulation to maintain public order and sustainable urban development (Dunn, 2003b).

This condition encourages local governments to develop policies that integrate regulation and empowerment approaches for informal economic actors. Public policy serves as a government instrument to address collective problems through planned interventions (Abidin, 2004). Therefore, street vendor management policies should not only focus on

controlling activities but also provide protection and opportunities for economic development.

The management of street vendors has shifted from a restrictive approach toward an empowerment-based strategy through relocation programs, business facilities, and institutional support from governments (Nugraha, 2023). This approach positions street vendors as economic actors who require guidance, protection, and opportunities for business improvement (Sidqi, 2022). Effective policy implementation is necessary to ensure that street vendor management programs achieve their intended objectives.

In Indonesia, street vendor management has become an important issue for local governments because it involves balancing spatial management, public order, and community economic empowerment (Melisa et al., 2025). Previous studies indicate that successful street vendor policies require effective communication, adequate resources, coordination among institutions, and involvement of policy target groups (Fatma Pitaloka et al., 2022).

Pamekasan Regency is one of the regions on Madura Island experiencing the growth of informal economic activities due to increasing population mobility and commercial development. As an administrative and economic center, Pamekasan has several strategic public spaces that attract community activities, including the Arek Lancor Monument area and several main roads in the city center. These locations have become attractive areas for street vendors because they provide high consumer accessibility and economic opportunities.

The increasing concentration of street vendors in the city center has affected the utilization of public spaces in Pamekasan Regency. Problems such as road narrowing, traffic disruption, reduced pedestrian accessibility, environmental issues, and declining urban aesthetics have encouraged the local government to formulate a structured street vendor management policy (Rohman & Prathama, 2023). These conditions demonstrate the need for government intervention to reorganize public spaces while maintaining attention toward the sustainability of street vendor businesses.

In response to these challenges, the Government of Pamekasan Regency issued Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2021 concerning the Management and Empowerment of Street Vendors (PKL). This regulation aims to create orderly urban spatial management while providing protection and empowerment opportunities for informal sector entrepreneurs.

The regulation reflects an effort to integrate public order objectives with economic empowerment strategies.

The implementation of street vendor management policies requires operational guidelines that provide clear mechanisms for regulation, relocation, supervision, and empowerment. Therefore, the Government of Pamekasan Regency issued Regent Regulation No. 36 of 2025 concerning Technical Guidelines for the Management of Street Vendors as the legal basis for implementing the policy. This regulation provides directions regarding business locations, operational procedures, supporting facilities, and government supervision mechanisms.

One of the main implementations of this policy is the establishment of the Food Colony Center in Barurambat Kota Village. The area was developed as a relocation location for street vendors who previously operated around the Arek Lancor Monument and other strategic locations in downtown Pamekasan. The establishment of the Food Colony Center represents the government's strategy to create a more organized culinary area supported by permanent business facilities.

The Food Colony Center was designed not only as a relocation area but also as an economic development center for micro and small business actors. The availability of business stalls, sanitation facilities, electricity, clean water, parking areas, and security services reflects an empowerment-oriented approach in street vendor management (Maulida et al., 2024). Through this approach, street vendors are expected to improve business competitiveness while contributing to local economic development.

The development of the Food Colony Center is consistent with the concept of integrating public space management and regional economic development. Relocation policies should consider not only the transfer of business locations but also consumer accessibility, business sustainability, and the ability of vendors to adapt to new environments (Winarman & Imawan, 2026). Therefore, the success of relocation programs depends on how effectively government policies are implemented and accepted by target communities.

Although the government has provided supporting infrastructure, the success of the Food Colony policy cannot be measured only through physical facilities. Policy implementation effectiveness is also influenced by communication, resource availability, implementer commitment, and the response of policy target groups (Edward III, 1980).

Differences in perceptions between government institutions and street vendors regarding relocation benefits may affect policy acceptance and sustainability.

Previous studies indicate that relocation policies often face challenges when vendors perceive changes in customer accessibility and income opportunities after moving to new locations (Safitri & Pambudi, 2024). Similar challenges may emerge in the Food Colony Center because changes in business location can influence customer flow, business adaptation, and vendor satisfaction. Therefore, examining the implementation process is necessary to understand whether policy objectives have been achieved.

The success of street vendor management policies also depends on continuous guidance, supervision, and coordination among implementing institutions. Research by Hapsari et al. (2023) shows that effective communication, sufficient resources, and consistent supervision are important factors in supporting the implementation of street vendor arrangement policies. Without stakeholder involvement and effective monitoring, relocation policies may encounter difficulties in achieving sustainable outcomes.

The implementation of street vendor policies involves various administrative processes because several government institutions may be involved, including agencies responsible for cooperatives, micro-enterprises, transportation, environmental management, and public order enforcement. Effective coordination among institutions is required to ensure that policy implementation operates according to established objectives. This condition highlights the importance of analyzing implementation mechanisms rather than merely evaluating policy outcomes.

The regulation of street vendors represents a complex public policy challenge because local governments must balance public order objectives with the protection of informal economic activities. Effective street vendor management requires strategies that integrate regulation, coordination, and consideration of target group needs. Therefore, policy implementation analysis is needed to understand how government strategies are translated into practical actions.

Fundamentally, street vendor management represents a form of public policy implementation aimed at balancing community economic interests with broader public interests in urban space utilization (Nugroho, 2014). Public policy is an authoritative government decision designed to address public problems through strategic interventions. The implementation of street vendor regulations generally emphasizes two objectives,

namely maintaining public order and providing protection and empowerment for street vendors.

The success of policy implementation is influenced by several factors related to the ability of implementing organizations to translate policy objectives into actions. Edward III (1980) explains that policy implementation is determined by four main variables, namely communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. This framework is relevant for analyzing the implementation of street vendor management policies because it examines the relationship between government institutions, implementation processes, and policy target groups.

Previous research has shown that communication between government agencies and street vendors is an important factor influencing policy acceptance. Fatma Pitaloka et al. (2022) found that clear communication and socialization processes affect the implementation of street vendor arrangement policies. Similar findings were reported by Hapsari et al. (2023), who emphasized that continuous interaction between implementers and street vendors supports policy effectiveness.

The availability of resources is another important factor in policy implementation because it determines the capacity of government institutions to execute programs effectively. Resources include financial support, infrastructure, human resources, and institutional capacity required during policy implementation (Irfan et al., 2018). Adequate resources enable policies to be implemented according to their intended objectives.

The commitment of policy implementers also influences the success of street vendor management programs. The attitude and willingness of government agencies determine how regulations are implemented in practice (Subandara et al., 2022). Furthermore, bureaucratic structure affects coordination, division of responsibilities, and implementation procedures among involved institutions.

Previous studies have examined street vendor management policies in various regional contexts. Fatma Pitaloka et al. (2022) analyzed street vendor arrangement implementation in Semarang Regency and highlighted the importance of communication and regulatory clarity. Rohman & Prathama (2023) examined street vendor management around the Tugu Pahlawan Museum area in Surabaya and emphasized the role of coordination and policy enforcement.

Other studies also demonstrate the complexity of street vendor relocation policies. Safitri & Pambudi (2024) identified differences in perceptions between governments and vendors as challenges in implementing relocation policies. Meanwhile, Maulida et al. (2024) emphasized that street vendor management should integrate spatial regulation with economic empowerment to improve vendor competitiveness.

Research conducted by Winarman & Imawan (2026) regarding street vendor relocation policies in Kebumen Regency showed that good governance principles, institutional coordination, and consideration of vendor interests influence relocation success. Similarly, Irfan et al. (2018) demonstrated that Edward III's framework is relevant for analyzing street vendor policies because communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure determine implementation effectiveness.

Although previous studies have provided valuable insights into street vendor management, most research has focused on general arrangement policies, enforcement mechanisms, or relocation programs in different regional contexts. Studies specifically examining the implementation of Pamekasan Regent Regulation No. 36 of 2025 concerning street vendor management through the Food Colony Center remain limited.

The Food Colony Center presents a unique policy context because it combines public space management with economic empowerment through the establishment of a designated culinary center. Therefore, this study is important to analyze how the policy is implemented, what factors influence its effectiveness, and what challenges emerge during the implementation process.

This study differs from previous research by focusing on the implementation of Pamekasan Regent Regulation No. 36 of 2025 concerning street vendor management at the Food Colony Center in Barurambat Kota. This research applies George C. Edward III's policy implementation framework to analyze communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure in the implementation process.

Theoretically, this research is expected to contribute to public policy implementation studies, particularly regarding informal sector management at the local government level. Practically, the findings are expected to provide recommendations for the Government of Pamekasan Regency in improving street vendor management policies that balance public space order and sustainable economic empowerment.

Based on the discussion above, this study aims to analyze the implementation of Pamekasan Regent Regulation No. 36 of 2025 concerning the Technical Guidelines for the Management of Street Vendors (PKL) at the Food Colony Center in Barurambat Kota by applying George C. Edward III's policy implementation theory. The study seeks to identify the implementation process, analyze supporting and inhibiting factors, and formulate recommendations for strengthening sustainable street vendor management policies.

METHODS

This study employed a qualitative research approach using a descriptive research design to explore and comprehensively understand the implementation of the policy on the management of street vendors (PKL) at the Food Colony Center in Barurambat Kota Village, Pamekasan Regency, East Java, Indonesia. A qualitative approach was selected because it enables researchers to investigate social phenomena from the perspectives, experiences, and interpretations of individuals directly involved in policy implementation. Unlike quantitative research, qualitative inquiry emphasizes understanding meanings, processes, and contextual realities rather than measuring variables statistically. According to Winarno (2026), qualitative research allows theories to emerge from empirical realities instead of being exclusively derived from existing theoretical frameworks. Consequently, researchers are able to interpret complex social phenomena holistically while maintaining sensitivity to the natural context in which those phenomena occur. Furthermore, qualitative research seeks to understand social reality through an interpretive and naturalistic perspective by examining phenomena within their real-life settings. Cresswell (2016) explains that qualitative research is intended to explore and understand meanings derived from social or human problems through the collection and interpretation of non-numerical data. Therefore, this approach was considered appropriate for examining how the policy governing the relocation and management of street vendors has been implemented and identifying the factors influencing its effectiveness

The research adopted a descriptive qualitative design guided by the policy implementation model developed by George C. Edward III. This model was selected because it provides a comprehensive analytical framework for evaluating policy implementation through four interrelated dimensions: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. These dimensions served as the principal research indicators throughout the study. The communication dimension examined the clarity, consistency, and

transmission of policy information from government agencies to street vendors, as well as vendors' understanding of the objectives of relocation to the Food Colony Center. The resources dimension assessed the adequacy of human resources, financial support, authority, and physical facilities provided by the local government to facilitate policy implementation. The disposition dimension focused on the commitment and attitudes of implementing agencies and the acceptance of relocated street vendors toward the policy. Finally, the bureaucratic structure dimension analyzed organizational coordination, division of responsibilities among implementing institutions, and the availability of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) supporting policy implementation. These four dimensions were systematically linked to the research objective of analyzing the implementation of Pamekasan Regent Regulation Number 36 of 2025 concerning the technical guidelines for organizing and managing street vendors at the Food Colony Center.

The research was conducted at the Food Colony Center, Barurambat Kota Village, Pamekasan District, Pamekasan Regency, East Java Province. The research site was selected purposively because it represents the primary location where the local government's street vendor relocation policy has been implemented following Pamekasan Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2021 concerning the Management and Empowerment of Street Vendors and Pamekasan Regent Regulation Number 36 of 2025 concerning technical implementation guidelines. The Food Colony serves as the main relocation site for vendors previously operating around the Arek Lancor Monument and several major streets in Pamekasan City. Its strategic role as a government-designated relocation center makes it an appropriate setting for examining policy implementation in a real administrative context. The research was conducted during the scheduled fieldwork period in accordance with the research timeline established by the researcher.

The study involved participants representing both policy implementers and policy beneficiaries. Informants were selected using a purposive sampling technique, which involves intentionally choosing participants based on their knowledge, experience, and direct involvement in the phenomenon being investigated (Sugiyono, 2021). In qualitative research, participant selection emphasizes information richness rather than sample size, allowing researchers to obtain comprehensive and meaningful data. The participants consisted of the Secretary of the SME Development Division at the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, and Trade of Pamekasan Regency; the Head of the Public Order and Community Protection Division and the Division Secretary of the Municipal Police (Satpol

PP); three relocated street vendors operating within the Food Colony Center; one customer; and one community member residing near the Food Colony area. These participants were selected because they possessed substantial knowledge regarding policy formulation, implementation, supervision, and the practical impacts experienced after relocation. Their diverse perspectives enabled the researcher to examine the implementation process comprehensively from both governmental and community viewpoints.

In qualitative research, the researcher functions as the primary research instrument, supported by interview guidelines, observation sheets, and documentation protocols. Data were collected using in-depth semi-structured interviews, participant observation, and document analysis. Semi-structured interviews were employed to provide flexibility for exploring participants' experiences while ensuring that discussions remained aligned with the research indicators (Sugiyono, 2021). Interviews focused on communication processes, resource availability, implementing agencies' commitment, bureaucratic coordination, and participants' perceptions regarding policy implementation. Participant observation was conducted directly at the Food Colony Center to examine physical facilities, business activities, interactions among stakeholders, and the utilization of supporting infrastructure. Documentary evidence was collected from official government regulations, including Pamekasan Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2021, Pamekasan Regent Regulation Number 36 of 2025, statistical reports published by the Central Bureau of Statistics (BPS) of Pamekasan Regency, reports from the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, and Trade, as well as relevant scientific publications and archival documents . The credibility and trustworthiness of the collected data were strengthened through triangulation of sources and data collection techniques, prolonged engagement, member checking, reference materials, and assessments of credibility, transferability, dependability, Creswell & Poth (2018) and confirmability.

Data analysis followed the interactive analysis model developed by Miles et al. (2014), which consists of three iterative stages: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. During the data reduction stage, interview transcripts, observation notes, and documentary evidence were systematically organized, coded, categorized, and filtered according to the four dimensions of Edward III's policy implementation model. Only information directly relevant to communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure was retained for further analysis. Subsequently, the reduced data were presented through descriptive narratives, thematic matrices, tables, and representative quotations from

participants to facilitate interpretation and identify relationships among emerging categories. The final stage involved drawing conclusions through continuous verification by comparing information obtained from different participants and multiple data collection techniques. Triangulation was also applied to examine consistency between empirical findings, Edward III's theoretical framework, and previous studies. Through this systematic analytical process, the study generated an in-depth understanding of how Pamekasan Regent Regulation Number 36 of 2025 has been implemented in managing street vendors at the Food Colony Center, while simultaneously identifying the supporting factors and barriers influencing policy implementation. The findings are expected to contribute to the development of public policy implementation studies and provide practical recommendations for improving the management and empowerment of street vendors in Pamekasan Regency.

RESULTS

The implementation of the street vendor (PKL) relocation policy to the Food Colony in Pamekasan Regency reflects the local government's commitment to reorganizing public spaces while promoting the development of local micro and small enterprises. The relocation program was initiated under the Pamekasan Regency Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) 2018–2023 and was implemented by the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, and Manpower (DISKOPUKMNAKER) in collaboration with several government agencies, including the Municipal Police (Satpol PP), the Transportation Agency (Dishub), and the Environmental Agency (DLH). Food Colony was established as an integrated culinary center intended to provide permanent business facilities for relocated street vendors while improving urban order, environmental cleanliness, and public convenience.

The findings indicate that policy implementation was supported by intensive communication between the government and street vendors before the relocation process was enforced. Various communication strategies were employed, including formal socialization meetings, mediation sessions, public announcements using patrol vehicles, installation of information banners, and door-to-door visits to vendors. According to the Head of the SME and Street Vendor Division, these communication efforts were conducted repeatedly before any enforcement measures were implemented. Likewise, Satpol PP confirmed that persuasive approaches were prioritized before relocation activities took place.

Most vendors acknowledged that they had received adequate information regarding the relocation policy, although economic concerns remained the primary reason for their reluctance to move.



Figure 1. Enforcement Activities Conducted by Satpol PP during the Relocation of Street Vendors from Arek Lancor
Source: Pamekasankab.go.id (2025)

Figure 1. Enforcement Activities Conducted by Satpol PP during the Relocation of Street Vendors from Arek Lancor shows that the relocation policy was implemented through a gradual process consisting of communication, socialization, mediation, and administrative enforcement. The presence of Satpol PP officers securing the former street-vending area indicates that enforcement was undertaken only after repeated persuasive efforts had failed to achieve full compliance among street vendors.

Interview findings indicate that communication became one of the strongest supporting factors in policy implementation. The Head of the SME and Street Vendor Division explained that the government had repeatedly informed vendors about the prohibition of trading activities in the Arek Lancor area through various dissemination channels before relocation was enforced. Similarly, representatives from Satpol PP stated that public announcements, mediation meetings, and coordination with village authorities had been conducted several times to encourage voluntary relocation. These findings demonstrate that the transmission, clarity, and consistency of policy communication were implemented before coercive measures were applied.

Street vendors also acknowledged that they had participated in several socialization meetings organized by the local government. Although they understood the legal basis and objectives of the relocation policy, many admitted that economic considerations influenced their willingness to relocate. Vendors perceived that their previous trading locations around Arek Lancor attracted considerably more customers due to their strategic position within the city center. Consequently, several vendors remained reluctant to occupy the available kiosks inside the Food Colony despite recognizing that the relocation policy had been clearly communicated.

DISCUSSION

The findings indicate that the implementation of the street vendors (PKL) relocation policy to the Food Colony in Pamekasan Regency has not yet fully achieved its intended objectives, despite being supported by a comprehensive regulatory framework and strong inter-agency coordination. Based on George C. Edward III's (1980) policy implementation model, policy success is determined by four interrelated variables: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The results demonstrate that communication, resources, and bureaucratic structure have functioned relatively well throughout the implementation process. However, the disposition of the target group, particularly the willingness of street vendors to comply with the relocation policy, remains the primary challenge that limits policy effectiveness. This finding suggests that successful policy implementation requires not only administrative readiness but also social acceptance from the affected stakeholders.

From the communication perspective, the study reveals that the Pamekasan Regency Government implemented multiple communication strategies before enforcing the relocation policy. Information dissemination was conducted through formal meetings, mediation sessions, persuasive door-to-door approaches, public announcements using patrol vehicles, and the installation of information banners in strategic locations. These communication channels demonstrate that the government adopted both formal and interpersonal communication mechanisms to ensure that all street vendors received consistent information regarding the relocation program. Accordingly, the communication indicators proposed by Edward III (1980), namely transmission, clarity, and consistency, were generally fulfilled. Most interviewed vendors acknowledged that they had received

sufficient information concerning the relocation policy and understood that the government's objective was to reorganize the Arek Lancor area as a public green space in accordance with local regulations. Therefore, the implementation problems identified in this study were not caused by inadequate communication but rather by factors emerging after the information had been successfully transmitted to the target group.

These findings are consistent with Winarno (2026), who argues that effective policy implementation largely depends on the government's ability to communicate policy objectives clearly to the target community. The relocation policy was introduced not merely to remove street vendors from public spaces but to establish a more organized urban environment while maintaining vendors' economic opportunities. Consequently, the government's gradual communication strategy before conducting enforcement activities reflects an effort to minimize social conflict during the relocation process. Nevertheless, this study also demonstrates that effective communication alone does not necessarily produce policy compliance. Although the vendors clearly understood the policy objectives, many continued to resist relocation because economic considerations were perceived as more important than administrative regulations. Therefore, this study extends Edward III's theoretical framework by suggesting that communication effectiveness should also be accompanied by perceived economic benefits to generate stronger policy acceptance among policy targets.

Regarding resources, the findings indicate that the implementation process was supported by adequate physical facilities and institutional capacity. The Pamekasan Government provided approximately 250 permanent stalls equipped with electricity, internet access, CCTV surveillance, toilets, prayer facilities, and parking areas. These facilities represent the government's commitment to providing a better business environment than the vendors previously experienced at Arek Lancor. In addition to physical infrastructure, implementation was supported by sufficient human resources involving several government agencies, including the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, and Manpower, the Municipal Police (Satpol PP), the Transportation Office, and the Environmental Agency. Each institution performed its responsibilities according to its respective authority, indicating that the resource component suggested by Edward III had been adequately fulfilled.

The results are in line with Suharto (2010), who emphasizes that street vendor management should not merely focus on relocation or enforcement but must also include adequate facilities that improve vendors' welfare. The Food Colony represents such an effort because it provides significantly better infrastructure than the vendors' previous trading locations. However, despite these substantial investments, many stalls remain vacant, particularly in the rear sections of the Food Colony. Several vendors have even returned to selling outside the designated area because they perceive greater economic opportunities there. This finding indicates that sufficient physical resources alone cannot guarantee successful policy implementation. Instead, economic attractiveness and customer accessibility remain decisive factors influencing vendors' willingness to occupy the officially designated facilities. Therefore, adequate infrastructure should be accompanied by broader economic strategies capable of increasing consumer traffic within the Food Colony.

Among the four implementation variables, disposition emerges as the most influential factor affecting policy outcomes. From the implementers' perspective, both the Department of Cooperatives and Satpol PP demonstrated strong commitment to enforcing the relocation policy. Rather than immediately applying coercive measures, government officials prioritized persuasive approaches through mediation, repeated socialization, and direct dialogue with street vendors. Such efforts illustrate that the implementers possessed positive attitudes and strong institutional commitment, as emphasized in Edward III's disposition variable. Enforcement actions were ultimately carried out only after extensive communication efforts had failed to achieve voluntary compliance.

Conversely, the disposition of the policy targets presents a considerably different picture. The study found varying levels of acceptance among street vendors. While some vendors supported the relocation because the Food Colony offered better facilities and a more organized trading environment, many others strongly opposed the policy due to declining customer numbers and reduced income after relocation. Several vendors eventually abandoned their assigned stalls and resumed selling outside the official Food Colony area because they considered roadside locations to be more profitable. These findings suggest that vendors' behavioral responses were primarily influenced by rational economic considerations rather than legal compliance alone. Consequently, policy implementation should not be evaluated solely through administrative compliance but also through its ability to sustain the economic livelihoods of affected communities.

These findings support Wahab (2014) argument that public policies should ultimately function as instruments for solving societal problems and improving public welfare. In the context of this study, although the relocation policy successfully reorganized public space, it has not yet fully addressed vendors' economic concerns. Consequently, the sustainability of the relocation program depends not only on relocating vendors physically but also on creating an attractive culinary destination capable of generating continuous customer demand. Without significant improvements in business opportunities, resistance among vendors is likely to persist despite the completion of administrative relocation processes.

Another important finding concerns the inconsistent enforcement perceived by relocated vendors. Several respondents argued that many unregistered vendors continue operating outside the Food Colony without receiving strict sanctions from the authorities. This situation creates perceptions of unfairness among vendors who have complied with the relocation policy. As a result, some compliant vendors gradually lose motivation to remain inside the Food Colony and eventually return to unauthorized roadside locations. This phenomenon demonstrates that consistency in law enforcement significantly influences policy acceptance. Selective enforcement not only weakens public trust but also reduces collective commitment to achieving the policy objectives. Therefore, strengthening monitoring mechanisms and ensuring equal law enforcement are essential for maintaining vendors' confidence in the relocation policy.

The bureaucratic structure represents the strongest implementation component identified in this research. The establishment of an Integrated Technical Team involving the Department of Cooperatives, Satpol PP, the Transportation Office, the Environmental Agency, the Police, and other governmental institutions reflects effective inter-organizational coordination. Regular coordination meetings, reportedly conducted several times each month, facilitate problem-solving and prevent overlapping responsibilities among implementing agencies. Furthermore, the existence of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) provides operational guidance for each institution, ensuring that implementation activities follow standardized administrative procedures.

These findings support Subarsono (2015), who argues that policy implementation is a continuous process requiring effective coordination among implementing organizations. The integrated bureaucratic structure established by the Pamekasan Government successfully supports daily Food Colony operations, including parking management,

environmental sanitation, security services, and vendor supervision. Consequently, the implementation barriers identified in this study do not originate from bureaucratic fragmentation but rather from the limited willingness of some vendors to fully comply with the relocation policy.

Theoretically, this study contributes to the development of George C. Edward III's policy implementation framework by demonstrating that successful communication, sufficient resources, and an effective bureaucratic structure are insufficient to ensure successful policy implementation when the disposition of the target group remains unfavorable. The findings suggest that economic considerations can outweigh administrative compliance, particularly in relocation policies affecting informal economic actors. Therefore, future policy implementation studies should pay greater attention to the interaction between policy acceptance and perceived economic benefits among target communities.

From a practical perspective, the findings provide important recommendations for the Pamekasan Regency Government. Future policy efforts should extend beyond physical relocation and law enforcement by strengthening the economic attractiveness of the Food Colony through promotional activities, culinary festivals, tourism development programs, and more consistent enforcement against vendors operating outside designated areas. Such initiatives may increase visitor numbers while simultaneously improving vendors' confidence in the sustainability of their businesses within the Food Colony.

This study also has several limitations. First, the research was conducted only within the Food Colony of Pamekasan Regency; therefore, the findings cannot be generalized to other regions with different socioeconomic and policy contexts. Second, the participants consisted primarily of government officials, law enforcement officers, street vendors, and surrounding communities, without including broader stakeholders such as tourists or regional business organizations. Finally, the qualitative approach emphasizes contextual interpretation rather than statistical measurement of causal relationships among implementation variables. Future studies are therefore encouraged to adopt mixed-methods or quantitative approaches to measure the relative influence of communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure on policy implementation outcomes more comprehensively.

CONCLUSION

This study aimed to examine the implementation of the street vendors (PKL) relocation policy to the Food Colony in Pamekasan Regency using George C. Edward III's policy implementation framework, which emphasizes four interrelated dimensions: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The findings indicate that the policy has been implemented with considerable institutional support; however, its overall effectiveness has not yet been fully achieved due to the gap between policy execution and the level of compliance among the target beneficiaries. From the communication perspective, the local government implemented a comprehensive dissemination strategy through formal socialization programs, persuasive approaches, public meetings, information media, and direct engagement with street vendors. These communication efforts successfully increased stakeholders' understanding of the policy objectives and legal basis, allowing most vendors to recognize the rationale behind the relocation program. Regarding resources, the government has provided adequate physical facilities, including permanent kiosks, electricity, internet access, CCTV, parking areas, sanitation facilities, and prayer rooms, while also ensuring institutional support through collaboration among relevant government agencies. These findings demonstrate the government's commitment to establishing a more organized and sustainable business environment for relocated vendors.

Despite these strengths, the disposition dimension remains the primary challenge affecting policy effectiveness. Government officials demonstrated a strong commitment by prioritizing persuasive communication before enforcing relocation measures. Nevertheless, many street vendors continued to exhibit resistance toward the policy, primarily due to concerns about declining customer numbers and reduced income after relocation. As a result, a considerable number of vendors preferred to continue operating outside the designated Food Colony area, leaving many officially provided kiosks underutilized. This finding suggests that successful policy implementation depends not only on administrative readiness but also on the willingness of policy targets to accept and trust that the new location can provide sustainable economic opportunities.

The bureaucratic structure also contributed positively to policy implementation. The establishment of an Integrated Team for Street Vendor Arrangement and Empowerment, supported by clear institutional responsibilities and cross-sectoral coordination, enabled government agencies to perform their respective functions effectively. Standard operating

procedures and coordinated management mechanisms minimized overlapping authority and facilitated a more systematic implementation process. Accordingly, this study confirms the continued relevance of George C. Edward III's implementation model in explaining the dynamics of public policy implementation, particularly by demonstrating that communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure operate as mutually reinforcing dimensions that collectively determine policy outcomes.

This research contributes theoretically by extending the application of Edward III's implementation framework to the context of street vendor relocation and urban culinary center development. Practically, the findings provide valuable insights for the Government of Pamekasan Regency in strengthening the effectiveness of the Food Colony through enhanced promotional strategies, increased economic activities, more consistent enforcement toward vendors operating outside the designated area, and stronger inter-agency collaboration. Future studies are recommended to incorporate the perspectives of consumers and non-relocated vendors or employ quantitative and mixed-method approaches to produce a more comprehensive evaluation of policy implementation effectiveness.

REFERENCES

Abidin, S. Z. (2004). *Kebijakan Publik*. Penerbit Pancur Siwah.

Aditya, A., Arafah, Y., Zahara, L., Zuhra, N., Dardaak, P. T. S., Yasmin, K. A., & Rizkina, G. (2024). Identifikasi Fungsi dan Efektivitas Jalur Pejalan Kaki di Pusat Kota Banda Aceh. *Bayt ElHikmah: Journal of Islamic Architecture and Locality, 2*(2), 70–77. https://doi.org/10.22373/jial.v2i2.9566

Agustino, L. (2017). *Dasar-Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Alfabeta.

Cresswell, M. J. (2016). *Logics and languages*. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315542652

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.

Dunn, W. N. (2003a). *Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik* (Edisi ke-2). Gadjah Mada University Press.

Dunn, W. N. (2003b). *Public policy analysis: An introduction* (3rd ed.). Prentice Hall.

Edwards III, G. C. (1980). *Implementing public policy*. Congressional Quarterly Press.

Hapsari, L., Lestari, H., & Rostyaningsih, D. (2023). Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan PKL di Kawasan Alun-Alun Simpang Tujuh Kabupaten Kudus. *Journal of Management and Public Policy, 12*(3), 79–97. https://doi.org/10.14710/jppmr.v12i3.39404

Haris, M., Laksana, B. I., Yefni, Y., & Hendrayani, M. (2024). Dinamika Sosial Ekonomi Pedagang Kaki Lima. *Jurnal At-Taghyir: Jurnal Dakwah dan Pengembangan Masyarakat Desa, 6*(2), 351–370. https://doi.org/10.24952/taghyir.v6i2.10885

Irfan, M., Kurniawati, N. K., & Syadzily, T. A. H. (2018). Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kota Serang. *JIPAGS: Journal of Indonesian Public Administration and Governance Studies, 2*(1), 83–93. https://jurnal.untirta.ac.id/index.php/JIPAGS/article/view/4770

Low, S., & Smart, A. (2020). Thoughts about public space during COVID-19 pandemic. *City & Society, 32*(1), 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1111/ciso.12260

Mammola, S., Carmona, C. P., Guillerme, T., & Cardoso, P. (2021). Concepts and applications in functional diversity. *Functional Ecology, 35*(9), 1869–1885. https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2435.13882

Masripah, S. N., Azzahra, A. U., Rohman, A., Fadjarajani, S., & Darmawan, C. (2026). Upaya Penerapan Konsep Pembangunan Berkelanjutan dan Berwawasan Lingkungan di Daerah Perkotaan. *Jurnal Regional Planning, 8*(1), 1–10. https://doi.org/10.36985/c0mc2084

Maulida, I. N., Hariyoko, Y., & Murti, I. (2024). Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima sebagai Upaya Peningkatan Daya Saing Usaha di Kabupaten Bangkalan. *Mandub: Jurnal Politik, Sosial, Hukum dan Humaniora, 2*(3), 116–128. https://doi.org/10.59059/mandub.v2i3.1357

Melisa, M., Nurdin, M., & Rajamemang. (2025). Strategi Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima dalam Meningkatkan Keindahan dan Ketahanan Infrastruktur Kota di Kabupaten Sinjai. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara, 22*(2), 296–302. https://doi.org/10.59050/jian.v22i2.361

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publications.

Mujahidin, D. (2026). Public policy implementation in street vendor management and its impact on urban economic development: Evidence from Bandung, Indonesia. *Journal of Economics, Management, and Public Policy, 1*(1), 13–17. https://journals.polimaritimekautama.ac.id/index.php/jempp/article/view/15

Muksin, I. (2024). Implementation of public policy for street vendors arrangements in Bandung City. *Politeia: Journal of Public Administration and Political Science and International Relations, 2*(1), 25–37. https://doi.org/10.61978/politeia.v2i1.184

Mustofa, A. Z., Sasongko, W., & Rukmi, W. I. (2026). Pengembangan Kualitas Alun-Alun Ponorogo yang Terdapat Aktivitas Pedagang Kaki Lima. *Journal of Environment Infrastructure and Information System, 2*(2), 119–128. https://jeiis.ub.ac.id/index.php/jeiis/article/view/59

Nugraha, D. F. (2023). Implementation strategy of street vendors arrangement policy. *Awang Long Law Review, 6*(1), 184–192. https://doi.org/10.56301/awl.v6i1.1018

Nugroho, R. (2014). *Kebijakan Publik di Negara-Negara Berkembang*. Pustaka Pelajar.

Pitaloka, A. F., Nuswanto, A. H., & Sihotang, A. P. (2021). Implementasi Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kabupaten Semarang Berdasarkan Peraturan Daerah Nomor 3 Tahun 2014 tentang Penataan dan Pemberdayaan Pedagang Kaki Lima Kabupaten

Semarang. *Semarang Law Review, 2*(2), 176–189. https://doi.org/10.26623/slr.v2i2.3820

Pratama, E. P., & Tukiman, T. (2024). Street vendor regulation enforcement in Keputran Market Surabaya by Satpol PP. *Journal of Management and Administration Provision, 4*(3), 314–321. https://doi.org/10.55885/jmap.v4i3.397

Rohman, M. R. A., & Prathama, A. (2023). Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Wilayah Museum Tugu Pahlawan Kota Surabaya: Studi pada Dinas Koperasi dan UMKM Kota Surabaya. *Irpia: Jurnal Ilmiah Riset dan Pengembangan, 8*(4), 31–41. https://doi.org/10.71040/irpia.v8i7.236

Safitri, A., & Pambudi, A. (2024). Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kawasan Stasiun Wates Kabupaten Kulon Progo. *Journal of Public Policy and Administration Research, 2*(5). https://doi.org/10.21831/joppar.v2i5.22539

Sidqi, A. N. F. (2022). Implementation of Regional Regulation Number 16 of 2014 concerning the arrangement and empowerment of street vendors (PKL) on the compliance level of business actors in Grobogan Regency. *Indonesian State Law Review, 4*(2), 93–98. https://doi.org/10.15294/islrev.v4i2.61389

Subandara, D. I., Febriyanti, D., & Isabella, I. (2022). Implementation of policy for controlling and licensing of street vendors in the City of Palembang. *Publica: Jurnal Pemikiran Administrasi Negara, 14*(2), 121–134. https://doi.org/10.15575/jpan.v14i2.19858

Subarsono. (2015). *Analisis Kebijakan Publik: Konsep, Teori, dan Aplikasi*. Pustaka Pelajar.

Sugiyono. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Alfabeta.

Suharto, E. (2010). *Membangun Masyarakat Memberdayakan Rakyat*. Refika Aditama.

Wahab, S. A. (2014). *Analisis Kebijakan: Dari Formulasi ke Implementasi Kebijakan Negara*. Bumi Aksara.

Winarman, A., & Imawan, S. A. (2026). Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL) Kapal Mendoan (Mangan Enak Karo Dolan) Kabupaten Kebumen Menggunakan Prinsip Good Governance. *Journal of Management and Public Policy, 15*(2), 973–984. https://doi.org/10.14710/jmpp.v15i2.57001

Winarno, B. (2016). *Kebijakan Publik Era Globalisasi: Teori, Proses, dan Studi Kasus Komparatif*. CAPS.